

MEMBERS' DECISIONS EXPLANATORY NOTE

The Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (IRB) is Canada's largest independent administrative tribunal. IRB decisions are subject to review by the Federal Court of Canada. IRB members are independent decision makers. Refugee Protection Division decisions are subject to appeal by the Refugee Appeal Division. On average over the past 5 years, 8% of all RPD decisions have been rendered on claims from persons admitted in Canada under an exception to the Safe Third Country Agreement, whose recourse from the RPD decision is to the Federal Court directly. The Refugee Appeal Division may reverse a Refugee Protection Division decision on the basis of information that was not available at the time of the Refugee Protection Division decision irrespective of whether the new information was provided by the appellant or as a result of more recent information being available because the country condition information has been updated. Over 43% of appeals allowed at RAD received new evidence following the RPD decision. Therefore, a decision that has been overturned by the Refugee Appeal Division is not necessarily an indicator of the quality of the decision-making at the Refugee Protection Division. The IRB recognizes that consistency and predictability are important components of quality decision making. To this end, it has put in place several processes to promote consistency while respecting the adjudicative independence of its members. For example:

- The IRB Chairperson issues guidelines and jurisprudential guides to assist members;
- The IRB has a highly trained Research Directorate that compiles country condition information for each country, which is disclosed in all refugee claims to ensure a consistent base of evidence for all claims and appeals;
- The IRB has developed a Quality Assurance Framework (QAF) for the Refugee Protection Division and Refugee Appeal Division, to formalize the activities, processes, strategies, and structures that contribute to quality decision-making;
- The Refugee Appeal Division publishes Reasons of Interest—noteworthy decisions from its members that address new, complex or novel issues, as well as model excellence in reason writing for Refugee Protection Division and Refugee Appeal Division members;
- Members participate in adjudicative consistency sessions, for example to discuss country conditions; and
- Members receive robust new member training and continual professional development, including regular jurisprudential updates.

The outcomes of decisions vary from one member to another because members render decisions based on the individual circumstances and evidence presented in each case. There are many factors that can impact a decision. Therefore, the concept of an “expected acceptance (recognition) rate” is not an accurate or appropriate indicator of adjudicative quality or tribunal performance. The limitation of the statistics is that they necessarily do not take into consideration the unique, and individual fact situations that are at the core of case-by-case adjudication.

Factors that can impact a decision

Variance due to inventory composition

Acceptance rates will vary due to the countries and types of claims in the RPD's inventory as well as the profile of decided refugee claims by the Board in any given time. For example, an inventory comprised of a higher volume of claims that could be suitable for the file review or short hearing process could increase acceptance rates for a period. For example, claims that are:

- from a country where the acceptance rate is 80% or higher, or where the acceptance rate in a claim type is equally high.
- from a country where identity is generally established by reliable documents.
- where the evidence is not ambiguous regarding risks faced by the person making the claim
- where there are no complex issues, either legal or factual.

Factors influencing individual claims

The assessment of refugee claims requires an evaluation of the individual circumstances of each person's claim. A refugee decision depends on the reasons for which a person is asking for Canada's protection. The person may fear persecution because of race, nationality, religion, political opinion, or because of membership in a particular social group. In addition, people could claim protection based on their fear of torture, risk to life or risk of cruel and unusual treatment or punishment.

Some of the factors that can impact a decision include: the claimant's country of origin; the region or city where the claimant lived; the claimant's age, ethnicity/nationality, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression or sex characteristics considerations; or whether the claimant spent time in a third country before coming to Canada without claiming refugee status in that country. A member must assess these elements and many others, which vary from claim to claim. Moreover, each claimant has the right to present their own case as they see fit, so the evidence presented may vary from claim to claim, even among similar claim types. Therefore, the outcome of a claim is influenced by the evidence presented (or not presented) by the claimant. Finally, the claimant's credibility can be a determining factor. Cases that appear to be very similar or identical at first glance may end up being quite different if one claimant is found to be credible and the other is not.

Variances within one country

With respect to claims from a specific country, these can also vary since different claim types may exist within the same country. For example, in a given country, a particular group may be mistreated while other groups may not experience mistreatment.

Regional Variances

With respect to regional variances, it is not unusual that clusters of claim types from one country or from specific countries migrate to different IRB offices, such that the profile of claims is not the same. For example, claimants from francophone countries often make their claim in Montreal.

Member Variance

Some Members of the Refugee Protection Division may be assigned a higher proportion of a certain country or claim type because of location and language of claimant and counsel, which could impact acceptance rates. For example, French-speaking Haitians claims in Quebec are generally heard by members in the RPD's Eastern Region. Therefore, a member with a large caseload for countries that are democratic with respect for the rule of law may have a lower overall acceptance (recognition) rate than

a member with a large caseload from countries where the rule of law is not respected. Some Refugee Protection Division members may be assigned a large number of file-review cases. File-review cases are those that are identified, based on specific criteria, as appearing to be well-founded such that they may be decided without a hearing. The final determination always rests with the member deciding the claim, but they tend to be overwhelmingly positive. Other members may be assigned more complex claims that tend to have lower acceptance (recognition) rates. Newer members may be assigned cases that lack complicated legal issues. A member's acceptance (recognition) rate for a given country can vary from year to year because of changes to any or all of the various factors already mentioned, such as changes in the conditions in the country in question and changes in the type of refugee protection claims from that country heard by the member.

Summary

Great caution should be exercised in drawing conclusions or inferences from statistics of acceptance (recognition) rates of members. The number of claims that an individual member accepts or rejects is related to many factors that can impact a decision. IRB members receive comprehensive and continual training, are monitored regularly, and must meet rigorous performance standards. High acceptance (recognition) rates or high rejection rates are not synonymous with competence or incompetence. Members in all four divisions must make their decisions in accordance with the law, and base them on the individual circumstances and evidence presented in each case